

Scorecard - Brantford Power Inc.

9/29/2016

Performance Outcomes	Performance Categories	Measures	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	Trend	Target	
									Industry	Distributor
Customer Focus Services are provided in a manner that responds to identified customer preferences.	Service Quality	New Residential/Small Business Services Connected on Time	98.70%	99.60%	99.70%	100.00%	99.50%		90.00%	
		Scheduled Appointments Met On Time	100.00%	99.50%	100.00%	100.00%	99.70%		90.00%	
		Telephone Calls Answered On Time	72.20%	64.70%	67.50%	76.90%	75.30%		65.00%	
	Customer Satisfaction	First Contact Resolution				82%	82.75%			
		Billing Accuracy				100.00%	99.94%		98.00%	
		Customer Satisfaction Survey Results				95%	94%			
Operational Effectiveness Continuous improvement in productivity and cost performance is achieved; and distributors deliver on system reliability and quality objectives.	Safety	Level of Public Awareness					81.00%			
		Level of Compliance with Ontario Regulation 22/04 ¹	C	C	C	C	C		C	
		Serious Electrical Incident Index	Number of General Public Incidents	0	0	0	0	0		0
	Rate per 10, 100, 1000 km of line		0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000		0.000	
	System Reliability	Average Number of Hours that Power to a Customer is Interrupted ²	0.49	0.21	0.56	0.42	0.51		0.36	
		Average Number of Times that Power to a Customer is Interrupted ²	1.24	0.81	0.71	0.66	0.99		0.75	
	Asset Management	Distribution System Plan Implementation Progress				87.4%	80.9%			
	Cost Control	Efficiency Assessment		3	3	3	3			
		Total Cost per Customer ³	\$484	\$496	\$507	\$503	\$512			
		Total Cost per Km of Line ³	\$28,324	\$37,066	\$39,373	\$39,047	\$40,235			
Public Policy Responsiveness Distributors deliver on obligations mandated by government (e.g., in legislation and in regulatory requirements imposed further to Ministerial directives to the Board).	Conservation & Demand Management	Net Cumulative Energy Savings ⁴					13.73%		54.32 GWh	
	Connection of Renewable Generation	Renewable Generation Connection Impact Assessments Completed On Time	83.33%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%			
		New Micro-embedded Generation Facilities Connected On Time			100.00%	100.00%	100.00%		90.00%	
Financial Performance Financial viability is maintained; and savings from operational effectiveness are sustainable.	Financial Ratios	Liquidity: Current Ratio (Current Assets/Current Liabilities)	2.23	2.15	2.05	1.92	1.99			
		Leverage: Total Debt (includes short-term and long-term debt) to Equity Ratio	1.23	1.30	1.20	1.11	1.03			
		Profitability: Regulatory Return on Equity	Deemed (included in rates)	8.57%	8.57%	8.98%	8.98%	8.98%		
			Achieved	7.50%	3.20%	11.60%	11.15%	11.06%		

1. Compliance with Ontario Regulation 22/04 assessed: Compliant (C); Needs Improvement (NI); or Non-Compliant (NC).

2. The trend's arrow direction is based on the comparison of the current 5-year rolling average to the fixed 5-year (2010 to 2014) average distributor-specific target on the right. An upward arrow indicates decreasing reliability while downward indicates improving reliability.

3. A benchmarking analysis determines the total cost figures from the distributor's reported information.

4. The CDM measure is based on the new 2015-2020 Conservation First Framework. This measure is under review and subject to change in the future.

Legend:

5-year trend

up down flat

Current year

target met target not met

2015 Scorecard Management Discussion and Analysis (“2015 Scorecard MD&A”)

The link below provides a document titled “Scorecard - Performance Measure Descriptions” that has the technical definition, plain language description and how the measure may be compared for each of the Scorecard’s measures in the 2015 Scorecard MD&A:

[http://www.ontarioenergyboard.ca/OEB/ Documents/scorecard/Scorecard Performance Measure Descriptions.pdf](http://www.ontarioenergyboard.ca/OEB/Documents/scorecard/Scorecard%20Performance%20Measure%20Descriptions.pdf)

Scorecard MD&A - General Overview

In 2015, Brantford Power Inc. (“Brantford Power”) exceeded all performance targets with the exception of its two system reliability measures. Bad weather and a delayed restoration due to a police investigation resulted in two significant outage events. Brantford Power plans to make investments aimed at reducing both the frequency and duration of outages, as well as improving internal and external communication during an outage.

2015 is the second year that Brantford Power has reported on its customer satisfaction measures. The results in this performance category exceed the industry performance targets and were consistent with the 2014 results.

Brantford Power strives to maintain or improve its overall scorecard performance by monitoring key performance measures throughout the year and addressing issues as they arise. Brantford Power plans to undertake initiatives which will mitigate risks, allowing continued delivery of the current performance levels.

Customers are encouraged to review the specific commentary on each of the reported performance categories outlined on the Scorecard in order to obtain further information on the particular measures. Brantford Power welcomes any customer feedback regarding its 2015 Scorecard.

Service Quality

- **New Residential/Small Business Services Connected on Time**

In 2015, Brantford Power connected 99.50% or 364 of 366 eligible low-voltage customers, i.e. those utilizing connections under 750 volts, to its distribution system within the 5-day timeline as prescribed by the Ontario Energy Board (“OEB”). The result is relatively consistent with the previous year. Brantford Power’s ability to meet customer expectations is attributed to the diligent coordination of Brantford Power’s engineering, construction, and operations teams with the local municipality, developers and contractors.

- **Scheduled Appointments Met On Time**

Brantford Power scheduled 954 appointments in 2015 to complete work requested by its customers, including connection and reconnection of services, inspections, and meter reading. The vast majority of those commitments, 951 or 99.70%, met within the required timelines. In keeping with customer expectations, Brantford Power exceeded the industry target of 90% again this year.

- **Telephone Calls Answered On Time.**

Brantford Power's customer service group handled 35,904 calls in 2015, over 75% of which were answered within 30 seconds. The outcome exceeds the prescribed target of 65% by 10% and represents a slight year-over-year decrease. The results reflect Brantford Power's ongoing focus on managing inbound customer telephone inquiries in a timely and efficient manner, while striving for service excellence.

Customer Satisfaction

Specific customer satisfaction measurements have not been previously defined across the industry. The OEB has instructed all electricity distributors to review and develop measurements in these areas and begin tracking by July 1, 2015 so that information can be reported in 2015. The OEB plans to review information provided by electricity distributors over the next few years and implement a commonly defined measure for these areas in the future. As a result, each electricity distributor may have different measurements of performance until such time as the OEB provides specific direction regarding a commonly defined measure.

- **First Contact Resolution**

First Contact Resolution can be measured in a variety of ways. For Brantford Power, the first contact resolution result of 82.75% was derived from a third-party random survey of 400 customers who had contact with Brantford Power between January and December 2015. The result indicates that a majority of customers responded favourably when asked whether their specific question or issue was resolved during their initial contact with Brantford Power's customer service group, and represents a slight year-over-year increase against the 2014 benchmark of 82%.

- **Billing Accuracy**

The OEB prescribed a measurement of billing accuracy which has been applied by all electricity distributors since October 1, 2014.

For the period of January 1 to December 31, 2015, Brantford Power issued 476,211 bills and achieved a billing accuracy result of 99.94%, exceeding the OEB's prescribed target of 98%.

- **Customer Satisfaction Survey Results**

The OEB introduced the Customer Satisfaction Survey Results measure beginning in 2013. At a minimum, electricity distributors are required to measure and report a customer satisfaction result at least every other year. At this time, the OEB is allowing electricity distributors discretion as to how they implement this measure.

Consistent with last year, Brantford Power worked with a leading market research organization to administer its annual customer satisfaction survey, with questions focused on key areas identified by both the OEB and Brantford Power, including: power quality and reliability, price, billing and payment, communications, customer service experience, and brand image. The "Top 3-Box" overall satisfaction result of 94% was derived from a 5-point scale survey of 500 residential and 100 business customers who were asked to provide a rating ranging from 1 (not at all satisfied) to a rating of 5 (very satisfied) on each key area. The survey, conducted by an independent third party in September 2015, has proven valuable in identifying both customer preferences and opportunities for improvement, many of which have been incorporated into Brantford Power's distribution system planning activities. Brantford Power intends to complete its next survey in 2017, using the OEB's proposed standardized survey tool and methodology, and until then, will continue to survey a sample of 50 customers per month who have made contact with the distributor to monitor satisfaction on a regular and ongoing basis.

Safety

Public Safety

The Ontario Energy Board (OEB) introduced the safety measure in 2015. This measure looks at safety from a customers' point of view as safety of the distribution system is a high priority. The safety measure is generated by the Electrical Safety Authority (ESA) and includes three components: Public Awareness of Electrical Safety, Compliance with Ontario Regulation 22/04, and the Serious Electrical Incident Index.

- *Component A – Public Awareness of Electrical Safety*

The Public Awareness of Electrical Safety component of the public safety measure does not have performance data prior to the 2015 scorecard because the survey was introduced for the 2015 scorecard. Residents of Brantford Power's service area scored 81% on their awareness of electrical safety for 2015. Brantford Power is a sponsor of the Children's Safety Village of Brant and provides educational materials related to electrical safety. Brantford Power promotes electrical safety to the public through its website and through annual safety seminars.

- *Component B – Compliance with Ontario Regulation 22/04*

Over the past five years, Brantford Power was found to be compliant with Ontario Regulation 22/04 (Electrical Distribution Safety). This was achieved through a strong commitment to safety, and adherence to company procedures and policies. Ontario Regulation 22/04- *Electrical Distribution Safety* establishes objective-based electrical safety requirements for the design, construction and maintenance of electrical distribution systems owned by licensed distributors. Specifically, the regulation requires the approval of equipment, plans, specifications and inspection of construction before they are put into service.

- *Component C - Serious Electrical Incident Index*

Over the past five years, Brantford Power has recorded zero serious electrical incidents. Brantford Power owns and maintains over 500 km of high voltage distribution feeders in the City of Brantford. Brantford Power runs an annual power line safety seminar directed at the local construction industry employers that are indirectly working around electricity at their job sites.

System Reliability

Brantford Power customers experienced an increase in both the average number of hours their power was interrupted and the average number of times their power was interrupted in 2015. The increase was primarily related to two significant incidents during the year. The two incidents alone were responsible for 71% of the total outage hours recorded in the year. One incident, in February 2015, was the result of a motor vehicle accident. Brantford Power's access to the scene was delayed as the police services completed their investigation. This prevented Brantford Power from being able to isolate the damaged section for approximately one hour. After isolation of the damaged section, Brantford Power was finally able to restore power to approximately 6,000 customers.

The other incident, in March 2015, was the result of an ice and rain storm. During that night seven separate outages on three feeders impacted over 3,600 customers. This performance was outside the scorecard target.

- **Average Number of Hours that Power to a Customer is Interrupted**

The number of interruption hours increased to an average of 0.51 outage hours per customer.

The OEB's standard target for outage statistics is the previous 5 years' average outage performance. Brantford Power's 2015 results represent an increase over that average of 0.36, indicating a miss. The 2015 average interruption hours is within the maximum and minimum of the previous 5 years' performance range. Brantford Power notes that, on average its customers experience 0.67 fewer outage hours than customers of other distributors with similar customer density and customers per km of line characteristics.

Brantford Power continues to view reliability of electricity service as a high priority for its customers and as such has identified a number of initiatives expected to reduce the number of interruption hours in coming years. Specifically, Brantford Power will install smart fault indicators reporting to our SCADA system remotely to reduce the time required to locate faults. Brantford Power also plans to install additional automated reclose switches to enable automatic isolation of faulted sections of feeders. Additionally, the planned implementation of an outage management system will improve internal and external communications during outages.

- **Average Number of Times that Power to a Customer is Interrupted**

The number of interruption times increased to an average of 0.99 outages per customer.

The OEB's standard target for outage statistics is the previous 5 years' average interruption performance. Brantford Power's 2015 results represent an increase over that average of 0.75, indicating a miss. The 2015 average interruption frequency is within the maximum and minimum of the previous 5 years' performance range. Brantford Power notes that, on average its customers experience 0.13 fewer outages than customers of other distributors with similar customer density and customers per km of line characteristics.

Brantford Power has identified initiatives that are expected to reduce the frequency of outages experienced by its customers. Specifically, Brantford Power will install equipment on its longer feeders to improve voltage sags, install additional automated reclose switches to reduce the number of customers impacted by faults on a feeder, and install an outage management system to improve internal and external communications during outages.

Asset Management

- **Distribution System Plan Implementation Progress**

Brantford Power has filed an application with the OEB for a full review of its rates effective January 1, 2017. As part of this application, Brantford Power filed a Distribution System Plan (DSP) covering the forecast period of 2017 to 2021.

Brantford Power currently measures its Asset Management performance based on the five-year average of its capital expenditures relative to its capital budget.

Brantford Power has reported an average of 80.9% completion of its capital budget expenditures. This is a reduction of 5% from the 2014 average. The drop in the average is attributable to the delay of a project to relocate Brantford Power's employees and equipment from three separate locations rented from the City of Brantford into a single location. The delay is the result of extended negotiations related to the new facility.

Brantford Power acknowledges that this number does not represent implementation of a DSP. BPI has proposed an updated methodology for measuring Distribution System Plan Implementation Progress, which BPI will report against, if accepted by the OEB, beginning with the 2017 Scorecard in 2018. The annual targets BPI is proposing represent the cumulative spending for each year in the DSP. BPI will compare the actual cumulative spending during its DSP period against these annual targets.

BPI is also aware of the OEB's intent to create a uniform methodology for distributors to measure their distribution system plan implementation, and will apply this methodology when it is available.

Cost Control

- **Efficiency Assessment**

Electricity distributors are divided into five groups based on the magnitude of the difference between their respective individual actual and predicted costs. In 2015, for the fourth year in a row, Brantford Power was placed in Group 3, where a Group 3 distributor is defined as having actual costs within +/- 10 percent of predicted costs. Group 3 is considered "average efficiency" – in other words, Brantford Power's costs are within the average cost range for distributors in the Province of Ontario. In the 2016 report (based on 2015 efficiency levels), 51% (36 distributors) of the Ontario distributors were ranked as "average efficiency"; 28% were ranked as "more efficient"; and 21% were ranked as "least efficient. Although our forward looking goal is to advance to the "more efficient" group, management's expectation is that efficiency performance will not decline and will likely remain at the Group 3 level until Brantford Power has completed its renewal and integration of core information systems.

- **Total Cost per Customer**

Total cost per customer is calculated by dividing Brantford Power's total cost by the total number of customers that Brantford Power serves. The total cost is the sum of Brantford Power's capital and operating costs.

The per-customer cost result for 2015 is \$512, which is a 1.8% or \$9 per customer increase over 2014. During the last five years, Brantford Power has demonstrated its ability to minimize annual cost increases. In fact, the reported cost per customer in 2015 is only \$28 dollars more than the level reported in 2011 representing an average annual increase of 1.5% per year approximating the annual change in the Consumer Price Index.

Brantford Power is continually looking for ways to improve its business processes to enable it to comply with increasing responsibilities and obligations for local distribution companies without negatively impacting overall costs to the customers where possible. The total cost in 2015 was \$477,847 or 2.4% higher than the level reported in 2014. When averaged over the two years, the average cost increase was 1.3% per year. For 2015, Brantford Power was able to mitigate overall cost increases as increases in general administration were partially offset by cost reductions in distribution operations and maintenance and billing and collecting costs.

In the coming years, changing demographics introduce a risk in the area of resources to perform core operational functions. Brantford Power's planning indicates

that staffing levels required to maintain performance levels and meet future demands along with the business systems necessary to support them will depart from the trend in headcount and compensation costs seen in previous years.

- **Total Cost per Km of Line**

This measure uses the same total cost that is used in the Cost per Customer calculation above. The total cost is divided by the kilometers of line that Brantford Power operates to serve its customers. The result of \$40,235 represents a 3.0% or \$1,188 increase. See above cost per customer section for cost drivers commentary.

Conservation & Demand Management

- **Net Cumulative Energy Savings**

Brantford Power's assigned target under the new 2015-2020 "Conservation First Framework" (CFF) is 54.32 GWh or 54,320 MWh of energy savings. On April 29, 2015, Brantford Power submitted its first CFF business plan to the Independent Electricity System Operator (IESO), with a 2015 in-year net energy savings target of 5,239 MWh, and received approval of that plan on July 27, 2015.

On June 30, 2016, the IESO presented its annual verified results report, confirming Brantford Power achieved net energy savings of 7,457 MWh, representing 13.73% of its total CFF target, and exceeding the 2015 target by 2,218 MWh.

Connection of Renewable Generation

- **Renewable Generation Connection Impact Assessments Completed on Time**

Electricity distributors are required to conduct Connection Impact Assessments ("CIAs") within 60 days of receiving a complete application. In 2015, Brantford Power completed four CIAs. All four CIAs were completed inside the prescribed time limit, resulting in Brantford Power meeting the standard 100% of the time.

- **New Micro-embedded Generation Facilities Connected On Time**

Electricity distributors are required to connect micro-embedded generation facilities within five business days of receiving all required authorizations, signed agreements and connection fees for a micro-embedded generation facility. Brantford Power connected seven micro-embedded generation facilities in 2015. All seven micro-embedded generation facilities were connected inside the prescribed time limit, producing a result of 100%, which exceeds the industry target of 90%.

Financial Ratios

- **Liquidity: Current Ratio (Current Assets/Current Liabilities)**

As an indicator of financial health, a current ratio that is greater than 1 is considered good as it indicates that the company can pay its short term debts and financial obligations. Companies with a ratio of greater than 1 are often referred to as being “liquid”. The higher the number, the more “liquid” and the larger the margin of safety to cover the company’s short-term debts and financial obligations. Brantford Power’s current ratio increased slightly from 1.92 in 2014 to 1.99 in 2015. Brantford Power continues to report a strong liquidity position maintaining a current ratio that is slightly below the 2.09 average level reported in the previous four years. This is despite funding capital expenditures from working capital. Brantford Power last obtained external capital financing in 2012. Brantford Power’s current ratio in subsequent years is expected to remain in the 1.5 to 2.0 range.

- **Leverage: Total Debt (includes short-term and long-term debt) to Equity Ratio**

The OEB uses a deemed capital structure of 60% debt, 40% equity for electricity distributors when establishing rates. This deemed capital mix is equal to a debt to equity ratio of 1.5 (60/40). A debt to equity ratio of more than 1.5 indicates that a distributor is more highly levered than the deemed capital structure. A high debt to equity ratio may indicate that an electricity distributor may have difficulty generating sufficient cash flows to make its debt payments. A debt to equity ratio of less than 1.5 indicates that the distributor is less levered than the deemed capital structure. A low debt-to equity ratio may indicate that an electricity distributor is not taking advantage of the increased profits that financial leverage may bring.

Brantford Power’s leverage position has declined to 1.03 times indicating that the current outstanding debt is only slightly higher than the equity level. In order to fund Brantford Power’s proposed Distribution System Plan, Brantford Power anticipates securing additional financing in the next few years to finance the capital program necessary to continue to replace aging infrastructure and equipment as their useful lives expire. This will ensure Brantford Power maintains its reliability performance and allow funding to make necessary investments to improve productivity or to meet other customer requirements. Once this external financing is secured, Brantford Power expects its Total Debt to Equity Ratio to range between 1.25 and 1.50.

- **Profitability: Regulatory Return on Equity – Deemed (included in rates)**

Brantford Power’s current distribution rates were approved by the OEB and include an expected (deemed) regulatory return on equity of 8.98%. The OEB allows a distributor to earn within +/- 3% of the expected return on equity. When a distributor performs outside of this range, the actual performance may trigger a regulatory review of the distributor’s revenues and costs structure by the OEB.

- **Profitability: Regulatory Return on Equity – Achieved**

Brantford Power’s return achieved in 2015 was 11.06%, which is within the +/-3% range allowed by the OEB. The average return over the past 3 years was 11.27% which is above the return included in Brantford Power’s approved rates. Brantford Power’s 2015 profitability reflects the third year of improved financial performance. As described below, the improved performance in each of the past three years is largely due to one-time items as described below.

The increased performance in 2013 was largely due to a one-time tax planning opportunity related to the timing of tax deductions related to the installation of electricity distribution infrastructure. The results also reflected some temporary cost savings due to short term staff vacancies.

With respect to 2014, Brantford Power’s performance was positively impacted by new distribution rates which went into effect on March 1, 2014. This was the first

time Brantford Power's distribution rates had been "rebased", or re-aligned with the current cost of service since 2008. In addition payments in lieu of taxes payable were reduced as a result of being eligible for additional tax deductions resulting from the 2.2 million dollar increase in net regulatory asset balances. Once Brantford Power collects these amounts, Brantford Power will record higher taxable income which will result in higher taxes at that time and resulting lower returns. Brantford Power also benefited from some temporary cost savings due to short term staff vacancies.

With respect to 2015, Brantford Power's performance was positively impacted by higher than expected specific service charges, additional efficiencies by sharing executives and financial services with Brantford Power's affiliated companies and reduced financing costs. Brantford Power also benefited from some temporary cost savings due to short term staff vacancies.

Note to Readers of 2015 Scorecard MD&A

The information provided by distributors on their future performance (or what can be construed as forward-looking information) may be subject to a number of risks, uncertainties and other factors that may cause actual events, conditions or results to differ materially from historical results or those contemplated by the distributor regarding their future performance. Some of the factors that could cause such differences include legislative or regulatory developments, financial market conditions, general economic conditions and the weather. For these reasons, the information on future performance is intended to be management's best judgement on the reporting date of the performance scorecard, and could be markedly different in the future.